“The Changing Character of Customisation: Content Personalisation in the News”

Google UK, London, 7 September 2011

Neil Thurman
“the era of personalization has begun”
- Eli Pariser.
Personalized Search for everyone
12/04/2009 03:01:00 PM

Today we’re helping people get better search results by extending Personalized Search to signed-out users worldwide, and in more than forty languages. Now when you search using Google, we will be able to better provide you with the most relevant results possible. For example, since I always search for [recipes] and often click on results from epicurious.com, Google might rank epicurious.com higher on the results page the next time I look for recipes. Other times, when I’m looking for news about Cornell University’s sports teams, I search for [big red]. Because I frequently click on www.cornellbigred.com, Google might show me this result first, instead of the Big Red soda company or others.

Previously, we only offered Personalized Search for signed-in users, and only when they had Web History enabled on their Google Accounts. What we’re doing today is expanding Personalized Search so that we can provide it to signed-out users as well. This addition enables us to customize search results for you based upon 180 days of search activity linked to an anonymous cookie in your browser. It’s completely separate from your Google Account and Web History (which are only available to signed-in users). You’ll know when we customize results because a “View customizations” link will appear on the top right of the search results page. Clicking the link will let you see how we’ve customized your results and also let you turn off this type of customization.

Check out our help center for more details on personalized search, how we customize results and how you can turn off personalization. Learn more by watching our video:
Media Companies in UK’s 50 most-popular brands online

Growth principally coming from TV broadcasters:
- ITV
- Channel 4
- Sky

and national newspapers:
- Associated Newspapers
- News International
- The Telegraph

Source: Nielsen, Feb 2011
Who Reported New Information
(Six Key Storylines)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Percent of All Stories</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Print</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local TV</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Niche Media</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Radio</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Media</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: For this and all related charts in this report, the sector includes the outlets' websites.
Qualitative Interviews
Growth of adaptive news at eleven national US and UK websites, 2007-10

Aggregate number of distinct adaptive news categories found

- Combined
- Active personalization
- Passive personalization

1st survey (Jun–Jul 2007)
2nd survey (Sept–Dec 2009)
3rd survey (Oct–Dec 2010)
Growth of adaptive news at eleven national US and UK websites, 2007-10
Growth of adaptive news at eleven national US and UK websites, 2007-10

Aggregate number of distinct adaptive news categories found

- Combined
- Active personalization
- Passive personalization

1st survey (Jun–Jul 2007)
2nd survey (Sept–Dec 2009)
3rd survey (Oct–Dec 2010)
Growth of adaptive news at eleven national US and UK websites, 2007-10

Aggregate number of distinct adaptive news categories found

- Combined
- Active personalization
- Passive personalization

1st survey (Jun–Jul 2007)
2nd survey (Sept–Dec 2009)
3rd survey (Oct–Dec 2010)

The University for business and the professions
### Table 1: Passive Personalization Formats:
- ‘Contextual Recommendations / Aggregations’
- ‘Geo-targeted Editions’
- ‘Aggregated Collaborative Filtering’
- ‘Multiple Metrics’
- ‘Social Collaborative Filtering’

### Table 2: Active Personalization Formats:
- ‘Email Newsletters’
- ‘One-to-one Collaborative Filtering’
- ‘Homepage Customization’
- ‘Homepage Editions’
- ‘Mobile Editions and Apps’
- ‘My Page’
- ‘My Stories’
- ‘Non-linear Interactives’
- ‘Other Explicit’
- ‘RSS Feeds’
- ‘SMS Alerts’
- ‘Twitter Feeds’
- ‘Widgets’
### Table 1: Passive Personalization Formats:

- ‘Contextual Recommendations / Aggregations’
- ‘Geo-targeted Editions’
- ‘Aggregated Collaborative Filtering’
- ‘Multiple Metrics’
- ‘Social Collaborative Filtering’

### Table 2: Active Personalization Formats:

- ‘Email Newsletters’
- ‘One-to-one Collaborative Filtering’
- ‘Homepage Customization’
- ‘Homepage Editions’
- ‘Mobile Editions and Apps’
- ‘My Page’
- ‘My Stories’
- ‘Non-linear Interactives’
- ‘Other Explicit’
- ‘RSS Feeds’
- ‘SMS Alerts’
- ‘Twitter Feeds’
- ‘Widgets’

---

The University for business and the professions
### Table 1: Passive Personalization Formats:

- ‘Contextual Recommendations / Aggregations’
- ‘Geo-targeted Editions’
- ‘Aggregated Collaborative Filtering’
- ‘Multiple Metrics’
- ‘Social Collaborative Filtering’

### Table 2: Active Personalization Formats:

- ‘Email Newsletters’
- ‘One-to-one Collaborative Filtering’
- ‘Homepage Customization’
- ‘Homepage Editions’
- ‘Mobile Editions and Apps’
- ‘My Page’
- ‘My Stories’
- ‘Non-linear Interactives’
- ‘Other Explicit’
- ‘RSS Feeds’
- ‘SMS Alerts’
- ‘Twitter Feeds’
- ‘Widgets’
### Table 1: Passive Personalization Formats:

- ‘Contextual Recommendations / Aggregations’
- ‘Geo-targeted Editions’
- ‘Aggregated Collaborative Filtering’
- ‘Multiple Metrics’
- ‘Social Collaborative Filtering’

### Table 2: Active Personalization Formats:

- ‘Email Newsletters’
- ‘One-to-one Collaborative Filtering’
- ‘Homepage Customization’
- ‘Homepage Editions’
- ‘Mobile Editions and Apps’
- ‘My Page’
- ‘My Stories’
- ‘Non-linear Interactives’
- ‘Other Explicit’
- ‘RSS Feeds’
- ‘SMS Alerts’
- ‘Twitter Feeds’
- ‘Widgets’
“Imagine a future in which your interface agent can [read / view / listen to everything], and construct a personalized summary. This kind of newspaper is printed in an edition of one. . . . Call it *The Daily Me.*”

Nicholas Negroponte, *Being Digital*, 1995
Changes in deployment of passive personalization features at eleven national US and UK websites, 2007–10
Friends' activity on CNN

Faraz J Karamat shared Steve Jobs: From visionary. • last Thursday

Patricia Fonseca shared http://www.cnn.com about 2 weeks ago

Faraz J Karamat shared Gadhafi threatened 2 months ago

Adam Blackwell shared AARP move on Snowden train wreck • about 2 months ago

Merja Myllylahi shared Ex-Facebooker Dog with everyone • about 3 months ago
Friends' activity on CNN

Faraz J Karamat shared Steve Jobs: From visionary. Last Thursday

Patricia Fonseca shared http://www.cnn.com about 2 weeks ago

Faraz J Karamat shared Gadhafi threatened 2 months ago

Adam Blackwell shared AARP move on Social train wreck about 2 months ago

Merja Myllylaho shared Ex Facebooker Do with everyone about 3 months ago
Changes in deployment of active personalization features at eleven national US and UK websites, 2007–10

- RSS feeds
- Email newsletters
- SMS alerts
- Mobile editions
- Widgets
- Homepage customization
- My page
- Twitter feeds
- My stories / clippings
- Homepage editions
- Other explicit
- One-to-one collaborative filtering

Comparison between surveys:
- 1st survey (Jun–Jul 2007)
- 2nd survey (Sept–Dec 2009)
- 3rd survey (Oct–Dec 2010)
What the editors said:

“the time and effort to personalize something” would put off all but a “relatively small number of people”
—Steve Herrmann, editor, BBC News website

“If you determine in advance who ‘The Daily Me’ is . . . Then you may miss some of the important things that you didn’t know you were”
—Rich Meislin, NYTimes.com
Changes in deployment of active personalization features at eleven national US and UK websites, 2007–10

- RSS feeds
- Non linear interactives
- Email newsletters
- SMS alerts
- Widgets
- Homepage customization
- My page
- Twitter feeds
- My stories / clippings
- Homepage editions
- Other explicit
- One-to-one collaborative filtering

Times active personalization feature found

1st survey (Jun–Jul 2007)
2nd survey (Sept–Dec 2009)
3rd survey (Oct–Dec 2010)
“fat finger problem”
Table 3: Adaptive interactivity on different platforms compared.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Forms of personalization</th>
<th>Mobile editions and ‘apps’</th>
<th>Full web editions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>22.54</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Data from eleven news providers, Dec 2010
Changes in deployment of passive personalization features at eleven national US and UK websites, 2007–10
Passive Personalization: ‘Aggregated collaborative filtering’
What the editors said:

“[the most read and most commended features have] gone down well . . . we don’t do enough”
—Neil McKintosh, then Head of Editorial Development, Guardian.co.uk

“I think there is something very useful and informative about what people are email each other”
—Pete Clifton, then Head of BBC News Interactive
Arteta in late moves

Mikel Arteta are two of the big names to switch clubs on deadline day, with the players to move.

Farah safely reaches five thousand

The big names to switch clubs on deadline day, with Craig Bellamy, Joe Cole and Scott Parker.

Features & Analysis

Storage mania

Why do we pay to keep things we've no space for?

Revolution retrospective

Memorable moments from Libya's six-month uprising

Desperate to work

Portugal's jobless generation leaves for former colonies

Messi fever

Cricket-mad Indians go crazy for football superstar

Croatia's cave-dwellers

Development threatens to destroy ancient underground species

Prize performers

Can Nobel winners help solve the present economic crisis?

In pictures

Behind the scenes with Japan's notorious Yakuza syndicates

Market Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Index</th>
<th>Last updated at 08:37 GMT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dow Jones</td>
<td>11613.55 ▲ 53.58 0.46%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nasdaq</td>
<td>2579.46 ▲ 3.35 0.13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTSE 100</td>
<td>5376.20 ▼ -18.33 -0.34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dax</td>
<td>5709.72 ▼ -75.13 -1.30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cac 40</td>
<td>3233.43 ▼ -22.93 -0.70%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BBC Global 30</td>
<td>5353.9 ▲ 5.68 0.11%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Most Popular

- A life in storage
- ‘Anti-cancer virus’ shows promise
- M charged over loan
- ‘Anti-cancer virus’ shows promise
- A life in storage
- ‘Anti-cancer virus’ shows promise
- M charged over loan
- ‘Anti-cancer virus’ shows promise
- A life in storage
Editorial judgement

“if there’s anything we have it is our judgement about what people are interested in”
—Anna Spackman, then editor Timesonline.co.uk

Readers “want someone to do some of the filtering work for them”
—Neil McKintosh, then Head of Editorial Development, Guardian.co.uk
Changes in deployment of passive personalization features at eleven national US and UK websites, 2007–10
Passive Personalization: Contextual recommendations

FROM OTHER NEWS SITES

- Globe Investor China’s economy soars - 3 hrs ago
- People’s Daily Online Economy soars, sets stage for more tightening - 5 hrs ago
- Yahoo! News China economy soars, sets stage for policy tightening - 7 hrs ago
- South China Morning Post China GDP growth hits 8.7pc, becomes world's second largest economy - 8 hrs ago
- Sydney Morning Herald China's turbo growth fans inflation fears - 9 hrs ago
- About these results
Implicit Personalization: Contextual recommendations
“Automatically direct users toward higher CPM ... content while maintaining recommendation quality and user engagement”

—Taboola website
Source: Newspaper Association of America
COMBINED US NEWSPAPER ONLINE ADVERTISING REVENUES and PAGE IMPRESSIONS

Source: Newspaper Association of America
Targeted Display Expected to Dominate Local Online Advertising

In Billions of Dollars

- ROS Display
- Targeted Display
- Paid Search
- E-mail
- Online Video
- Online Audio

Targeted display

Non-targeted display ads

Source: Borrell Associates 2010 Compass Report, based on the first three quarters of 2010
Note: ROS Display refers to non-targeted display ads

PEW RESEARCH CENTER’S PROJECT FOR EXCELLENCE IN JOURNALISM
2011 STATE OF THE NEWS MEDIA
Rise of Targeting

Coming land war for margin in the display ad delivery chain

Ad Delivery Players

CDNs
Display
Ad Serving
Rich Ads
Video Nets
Ad Networks

Publishers

Publisher margins get squeezed

Ad Targeting Players

bluekai
OMNITURE
quontcast
acerno
MediaMath
invite media
exelate
media6

2010 IAB Annual Leadership Meeting
“Journalists should worry about creating the content and other people in technology should worry about bringing the content to the right group...by personalization”

“Once we get personalization working for news we can take that technology and make it available to publishers, so they can transform their website appropriately [to suit the interests of each visitor]”

Provision of personalized news features at eleven news websites, Oct–Dec 2010
Provision of personalized news features at eleven news websites, Oct–Dec 2010

The University for business and the professions